

Minutes from Four Corners Future Forum

A.M. Session - Economic Development Workgroup Attendees

1. Michael Sage
2. Arvin Trujillo
3. Judy Powers
4. Trent Thompson
5. Ryan Rhodes
6. Heather
7. Donna H
8. Suzy Baldwin
9. Bill Herrera
10. Bruce Armstrong
11. Eileen Yarborough
12. Henry Silentman
13. Roger Zalneritis
14. Warren Unsicker
15. Madonna While
16. Melissa Meechan
17. Devin Scott
18. Laura Marchino
19. Geri Gamber
20. Joanne Bryant
21. Sean McCabe
22. Steve Grey
23. Alicia Corbell
24. Barbara Ake

Opening Question - What Keeps Us Up At Night?

- Skilled workforce – address Opioid Drug Problem
- Prospect of unemployment - new business
- What's the plan? – what to invest in – new jobs – low hanging fruit
- Water – snow packs
- Local meaningful jobs
- Tariffs – impacts
- Build on Rez Economy
- Rebuilding for business and tourism – business success
- Coal Impacts
- Cycles of industry-impacts of deadlines/dislocations
- Energy industry decline

- 4/25 Summit – Rebuild post-coal economy
- Broadband – needs to be everywhere
- Drought and fires
- Small business supports
- Jobs for our youth
- Get countries working together
- The kids and their education
- How to stay ahead of the curve – relevant education
- Changes – power plants and the impacts
- Federal and state budget cuts
- What will happen – new jobs

EDDs, COGs, AOGs & EDOs – Strategy Moving Forward

- US Rotations across the 4 Corners ... mutual learning and support
- Relationships...give it time, do it together
- New economic dynamics – time to communicate and coordinate
- Hone it down to 1 or 2 goals – small successes – demonstrate!
- Bring kids into this!
- Catalytic project – the rail line
- Focus and branding – 4 Corners Region
- Meetings and action
 - Any part of region wins/we all win!
 - Synergize maximize \$ investments
 - Find the commonalities
- The ancient regional trade network --- bring it back!
 - A “System” – break it down
 - Messages
 - Show results
 - On Boarding
 - Documentation
- Parallel Paths
- Bring in other partners Come along side us
- Look at all the economic priorities – not just our own plans – contribute to make it stronger
- Include Tribal Enterprises – mutual education on how the different entities work
- A “safe place” – we share here openly – *mutual trust* – don’t exacerbate the “issues” back home
- All Tribes venues?
- Minnesota – tribal involvement? – How long did it take them to regionalize?
- Every win – publicize; attract, interest – *Town Halls*

At The Table

- It takes resources to engage people and build the system – where do they come from?
- What mistakes did Region 5 make? Or what did they learn?
 - Fail Forward
 - Be persistent!
 - Example of grant writing - \$Millions
 - Celebrate the small wins
 - Full transparency
- Tribes individually, or inter-tribal?
- From “best kept secrets” identifying our strengths and then leverage

“The Forum 2.0 Challenge”

- Increase “Investments in the Region” – from within and without
- Build the system as-we-go
 - Transparent
 - Participatory
 - “Progress moves at the speed of trust”
- Public process that makes sense
- Stand together/add support to each other
- “Thinking **Locally**, Act **Regionally**, Think **Regionally**, Act **Locally**”
- Inter-disciplinary/cross regional/cross-sectoral teams
- Start an events page and building a list to support initiatives (link with a date – Warren/Devin to take action)
- Being a part of other people’s summits – Partnering either from a segment or leading a session
 - Sean asked the question of whether someone could present Navajo Nation this AM session information and where we have been and where we are going

Questions for Facilitated Discussion

What is your understanding of why these meetings are being held? What are the pros and cons on moving on the regions issues as a collective group vs. individual communities?

Pros

- Treat collaboration as an opportunity instead of a threat – competitors become collaborators in a bigger game
- Work together to make vision a reality
- Maximize joint resources
- Pool resources across jurisdictions, governments, etc.
- Practice community building – working together
- Opportunity for community building and connectivity through communication, cooperation, collaboration
- Maximize efforts and resources
- Attract and diversify industries/economic drivers
- Hearing of initiatives (USDA – EPA Grant) actions have been taken
- Not competing – helping the region collectively
- Comprehensive plan
- Leverage working together (states)
- Have everyone working together = comprehensive plan
- Not competing – helps community with a comprehensive plan (better)
- Leverage the four states, political resources
- Communicate feel vs. individual interest groups and working together
- Not competing
- Helps communities plan better
- Find common concerns that we all agree
- Collaborative opportunity
- Collective group; recognize no state lines – only common issues and wins
- Sharing resources (time, energy, people, etc.)
- Economies of scale
- Diversity of resources
- More funding opportunities (region stronger) – Access to different pools
- Build stronger relationships
- Individuals' have failed – let's do this collectively
- Greater outcomes
- Reduce duplication of efforts
- Leverage talent and resources
- Know models that work
- Working together and not separate
- Resources/political will and more resources

- *NOTE: Why are we here....*Regional long term economic collapse, build regional strategy, collaborate on regional economies, collaborate on regional economies and build partnerships); to come together to capitalize on synergies and propel transitioning; stronger communities with strengths of 4 States for common causes, to move the region forward economically without different groups, doing different things and to collaborate; Use strengths of each 4 states, collaborate, move forward together on economic development; to generate ideas, to move the region forward economically without different groups different things and collaborate

Cons

- Lack of leadership
- Risk of impeaching ideas to other communities
- Need leadership
- Capital assessment – little know about the facts and data
- Boundaries (state, government agencies, tribes, counties/cities
- Large group of people
- To move in 1 direction
- Different reports
- Many governing entities
- Size of region
- Not all sectors, tribes are in the room
- Jurisdiction
- Difficult size
- Too many entities and not all at the table
- 4 State too big to handle in identifying issues
- Diverse and large area; Sovereign nations large area, four states
- Different views
- Lack of connectivity
- Hidden agenda
- Scope creep
- Start and stop of priorities (choosing priorities (which regions?))
- Each group moves at a different speed (communities, governments)
- Getting and keeping engagement
- Fighting/balancing legacy economics vs. innovation
- Communities have started projects
- More complex and more difficult
- Too much self-interest – too narrow
- Might not be achievable
- Haven't seen others failures/pitfalls

- Bureaucratic challenge
- Large groups are hard to coordinate

(On the Fence of Pro and Con)

- Consolidation of efforts – everyone has a voice
- Working regionally on a variety of sectors – enhancement economic diversification
- To create a unified effort to develop economic strength in the 4 corners region
- Understanding to address coal impacts on the region
- Competitors become collaborators in a bigger game pool resources – collators is opportunity not a threat
- Challenges – how to leverage state region organization resources federal agency etc.

Questions for Facilitated Discussion

If a “magic wand” could be waved today, how would you power forward and set the table for 4-Corners Success in ten words or less?

- For everyone to have a chance to walk in everyone’s shoes
- Recognition that every economic driver is driven by human (workers)
- Demonizing any sectors hinders economic benefits for all
- Collaborate to build rail and robust broadband system for/to 4C region
- Collaborate to build out rail and robust connectivity for 4C/SJB!
- Enable the 4-Corners to participate fully in macro-economic trends such as technology, health care, etc.
- Align 4-Corners with macro-economic trends
- I would give the general population a vision of and hope for what could be
- We have buy-in from all stakeholders and goals and customers clearly defined
- Protect the environment, halt fossil fuel development, grow agriculture, creativity
- Communities believe their voices are heard and strategies are relevant
- Improve quality of life, support environment, expand preventative health care
- Implement a version of Farmington Quality of life development (1982-2007)
- Establish and pay standard livable wages or minimum yearly salary
- Every person replaces every statement with a question for 30 days
- All citizens age 16+ serve one year in public service
- Foster inter-community commerce for the economic benefit of all
- Provide region with infrastructure and workforce to make economic development unnecessary
- Engage regional leaders in developing incentives to drive economic growth
- Aggressively incentivize and recruit methane mitigation and solar industries to the region
- Four Corners evolves to energy hub of renewable energy
- Find common concerns to 4 States work on – locally but report regionally
- Diversify economy transition from historic resource on fossil fuels – clear resources – renewables

- Possibilities – additional educational resources (1 year university)
- Inclusivity – connection to outside world (technology) enticing younger generation to remain in the community
- Agreement to execute one project to complete in one year
- By continuing the efforts – partnering, listening and being helpful to others
- Integrate outdoor recreation as an economic driver throughout the region
- Take advantage of natural and man-made amenities to make it a flourishing destination
- Establish MOV partnerships between all EDDs in the Four Corners Region
- To create a Four Corners CEDS
- Establish a Four Corners Regional Commission
- Have Oil and Gas leaders take a participating seat at the table
- Successful communication of initiatives and progress
- Get to know your neighbors
- Talk to every/all key stakeholders

Questions for Facilitated Discussion

To ensure critical “Buy-In,” what are the three things we must do to encourage support at all levels? (Cultural, Economic, Educational, etc.)

- Inclusion – clear vision
- Quality of life (highlight it)
- Collaboration with leaders and continued supporters
- Sector champions
- Celebrate cultural differences
- Celebrate cultural differences – highlight them as values
- Transparency
- Clear concise information
- Educate persuade others to commit
- Communication – clear leadership and communicate and follow through
- Unifying vision
- Statement of principles
- Single point of contact
- Good leadership/organization
- Good communication
- Financial resources
- Address the most basic needs of the community
- Ensure communication within communities
- Make sure leadership reflects the communities (representation matters)
- Three things to encourage support
 - Equitable process
 - Follow-through on commitments to act
 - Open information
- Leaders must have no agenda
- Have actions/goals and timeline
- Representation from all communities
- Inclusion of all opinions if they don't attend we go to get the information
- Attainable goals
- Timeline
- Input from all!!
- Action, Inclusion and neutral leadership
- Data driven information; comparisons – so that we know what to fix and neutral=competitive interests
- Establish a common language (Communication, be flexible in approach, get engagement from industry leaders (oil and gas, etc.) and actively involve youth through elderly in process
- Listen and let people know they've been heard
- Equal partnership/true collaboration

- Diverse leadership
- Measurable goals
- Trust

Questions for Facilitated Discussion

Considering the .05 Fixes in the Breakout Summaries: Pick one or two from each Breakout Opportunity Area and identify one goal, action, and organization/individual that could potentially help to get this initiative started today.

- Agriculture goal – water management plan
 - Action –
 - bring plans together
 - Share information
 - Identify who controls water/water rights
 - What water is used for
 - Organization identified – each state, county, tribe, municipalities, water district and water boards
- Manufacturing goal
 - Action
 - Compile list of all products made in region
 - Identify all counties, tribes, and gaps in each county/tribes
 - Org/ind - Each EDO in their respective areas/communities
- Manufacturing
 - Goal, Action and Organization/Individual
 - MEPS to compile a list of Manufacturing Extension Partnership products
- Capacity
 - Goal, action and organization/individual
 - Take advantage of existing summits – 4CFF to be included in summits and conferences
- Technology
 - Broadband – goal – fiber loop in 4 corners area
 - Organization – meeting
- Engagement of elected officials
- Education – engage board members and administration including youth (STEM)
- International trade exports assessment
- Develop solar generation capacity – investigate local ownership and transmission lines
- Historic destinations
 - Reuse
 - Repurpose
 - Restore
- River trails

- Brownfields (alternate uses) (Identify all in region)
- Air freight (manufacture something shipped through air freight)
- **Manufacturing** that went under?
 - Manufacturing opportunities
 - Workforce analysis?
 - Education?
- Agriculture
 - Organization – local foods and local places steering committee
 - Agriculture science center
 - NAPI
 - Youth coalitions e.g. FFA, 4H
- Manufacturing
 - Compile list of products
 - “VAICS Coded” Who administers?
 - Action – Freedom of information request
 - Organization: Department of Taxation and Revenue
 - Industry trade associate membership? (By County)
 - Develop common language
- Infrastructure
 - Goal/action/individual/organization
 - Include the youth – asking youth what they need for infrastructure
- Tourism
 - Central info authority (i.e. website – 4 states region)
- Open Economy
 - Promoting natural amenities (i.e. river reach)
 - Brg rafting companies; tours to Bisti
- Manufacturing
 - List of all items made and published for region – each EDO arranges for local survey
- Capacity
 - Develop a tool (web, email, meetings) that allows regional partners to share available resources, goals, work, etc.
- Infrastructure
 - Create a survey to determine “What” we are doing in the region – use 9 areas – what are we making (manufacturing). What services do we offer? And create a resource guide to send out regionally. Have local EDOs, Chambers, academic groups, etc. send out to everyone
- Health/Agriculture – who are stakeholders
 - SWOT and pest
 - Local food/local places grant earned – upcoming planning workshop (June) contact Molly Jackson-Nielson – farmfarmingtonnm@gmail.com)

- Creative Economy – talk about the issues; work with people already in arts to identify barriers (values, mass production, etc.) Native Arts Association?
- Infrastructure
 - Make sure young people and young leaders are involved ASAP – especially in community outreach meetings
 - Network COGS (potentially regarding large projects that could benefit multiple regions – areas)
- #7 – also applies to 3. Federal infrastructure funding coming for broadband projects. Develop shovel ready public/private project
- Manufacturing
 - List manufactures and products
 - State MEP
 - State WFC
 - List of products in region
 - Include local agriculture products (NAPI, etc.)
- Capacity
 - AZUNMCO Web page
 - Build 4Corners Consortium page
- #5 Identify stakeholders
 - Identify key stakeholders and collaborate, evaluate capital resources and needs
 - Utilize EPA local food, local healthy grant as catalyst
- #6 Creative Empower innovators
 - SJC Maker Space
 - Invents! Coop Support
 - Identify what the issues are – Valuation of artist product
- Agriculture
 - Encourage participation in agriculture census to get accurate picture of existing e.e.g population and needs
- Education (K-12)
 - Include boards and administration
 - Focus on STEM

Questions for Facilitated Discussion

For each Breakout Opportunity Area (Theme): Are there any strategies or fixes clearly missing? Are there any strategies or fixes that clearly need to be removed?

- Funding college education for in-region schools (i.e. El Dorado Promise)
- Human Capital-take care of people – safety and accountability, character
- Increase energy awareness – make sure people really understand if legislation, production, impact – good or bad
- Continue to support transportation infrastructure
- Protecting natural resources
- Reviewing and supporting legislation that promotes regional initiatives
- Manufacturing that went under?; Manufacturing opportunity? Workforce Analysis?
- Education? Economic Development plan/strategic plan so education/training matched with need “Chicken or egg problem” young professionals have job locally – diverse workforce training, e.g. for learning disabilities
- How does process or infrastructure – project economic growth proceed? Willing to risk investment in infrastructure // incentives, e.g. taxes as the delta
- Does extractive industry discourage tourism?
- Conversation on water
- Funding
- Congruent [policies i.e. state boundaries
- Transportation
- Afford-able housing
- Zoning
- Fixes
 - Health-mobile clinics
 - Congruent policies
 - Alignment of transportation
 - Buses
 - Transit
 - Ride Sharing
 - Bikes

Questions for Facilitated Discussion

In five words or less: What do you believe to be the overarching vision for the next steps in this Four Corners Economic initiative?

- Items Identified
 - Innovation
 - Inclusivity
 - Plan of Action
 - Cooperation
 - Collaboration
 - Branding mission and vision statements
 - Leadership need champions for every sector
 - Project management implementation
 - Overarching vision for next steps: innovation, collaboration, cooperation, action plan of action
 - Inclusive
- New Mexico, Colorado, Utah and Arizona
- Gateways
 - 4 Corners
 - National Parks
 - Amenities
 - Historical/Cultural
- Zoning, land use, river frontage, clean-up
- Explore/focus on retention/expansion vs. recruitment
- Could specialty crops expand footprint?
- Identify actionable items with timeline
- Consensus on approach to diversification
- Commonality within unique, diverse cultures
- Vision – to next steps
 - Define terms and goals and align decisions/efforts with goals
- Clearly define and understand economic development
- Align 4-Corners with Macro Economic Trends
- Define three next steps
-

Own your Own

What question are we not asking? Is there an “elephant in the room” we are ignoring?

- Why are oil and gas leaders not participating?
- Why are oil and gas local elected officials not participating?
- How do we define success?
- How do we know we are making an impact?
- What are the main barriers to progress
- What are the most basic needs of the community and are they being met?
- Who can contribute money, facilities, meals, sponsorship, etc. to this cause?
- What does the timeline for the four corners forum look like, one year, five years, and ten years out?
- How can we counter-balance the fact that some of our largest economic stakeholders are investors – only in San Juan Basin and have no commitment to the communities
- Abandonment
- Revitalize
- Who heads next steps? What are the next steps?
- How are we going to pay for it?
- How do we protect our natural resources (Water, air, sensitive lands)
- Who are we forgetting (in this process) and what are extended resources (BP local vs BP Corporate) and What about academia – developing the new leadership
- Education sector engagement – youth engagement and elected official engagement
- What role could the workforce system from each state serve? I believe they are a critical missing elephant
- Who is willing to commit now? – Who is willing to invest now? How will we \$? How do we best approach the congressional representative for this region?
- Who is not at the table that should be with us? In addition to Region 5, can we find other recovery templates? Hybridize multiple – let’s talk to Moab before going too far down the road. They have indicated a willingness to share insights and avoid pitfalls
- What do we want our community to be like in ten years demographically, economically, etc?
- “When can we” ...?; not “if” we ...; “How can we” ...?
- Do we have the will/determination to follow through?
- How can one’s be a good steward of the land
- We need to include our legislators to be sure there are grants we can secure
- Where are the K-12 education administrators? Where are our elected officials in this process?
- What is the top priority for each group for education (participants) maybe top 3 priorities
- What level of interstate corporate already exists in the region? (who and why)
- What level of completion – what are pain points (e.g. young people leaving for opportunities in other states)

- How do we engage the very wealthy and billionaires who can readily fund some projects? Philanthropically or as investors – how do we engage business community?
- I think it is important to be proactive on retail planning to help local/small retailers, keep dollars in the community, and help small retailers/growers compete with out-of-town corporations. I don't think retail should be left out of the process, just because it happens automatically – how it happens is crucial

Is there an “elephant in the room” we are ignoring?

- Every successful large scale project in Farmington, Aztec and Bloomfield was led by Oil and Gas leaders from Animas Power Plant and our ballfields/golf courses to the Aztec/Navajo Dam road to the San Juan Regional Medical Center and SJC School of Energy
- What is the timeline for this initiative? (5 years, 10 years, 50 years, 100 years)
- Greed/money and reluctance to change
- The massive nature of this initiative and how to make economic development congruent throughout the region
- How can we all use the water?
- Money – long term funding
- What will be our first tangible project? (e.g. what will be our “Sprouts” market)
- We need a way to make this information available to everyone along with a way to offer input – perhaps a website. Reports could be uploaded and made available as pdfs, questions and perhaps community meetings could be established to keep the dialogue going
- Tension between fossil fuel energy foundation – other economic diversity
- Trust
- Disproportionate impact of energy influence
- Feel that session was not well defined to 2nd group arriving at 11:30
- The fossil fuel economic history of the region and the wiliness/ability of region to evolve to something different
- Resistance from traditional industries to diversify our economy
- Lack of youth involvement
- Lack of empathy (character not to collaborate)
- How do we benchmark our success/progress – what data do we need?
- Who is going to supply the money for this effort and how will energy and environment co-exist and what about the “cultural barriers”
- Education – an elephant that needs to be invited into the room
- Traditional dominance of the energy and extractive sector – disproportionate influence – industrial duress
- Sometimes it feels like a New Mexico/Farmington initiative
- Have we addressed the issues of TRUST? Who is the individual, organization or entity that will take the lead to champion this effort? Defined stakeholders?

- There is a significant segment of the population that do not want change or new people in the area – status quo is good with them
- Are there “Entrenched interests” whose only goal is to continue to maintain the status quo? I think there is and to the extent they are allowed to continue true economic development will suffer – example: NM senate Bill 47
- Policy makers, investors, investment \$’s, voice of our youth!
- Discrimination – the lack of understanding the disregard of one’s community tradition
- Is what we are proposing realistic?
- Globalization – people don’t necessarily understand the concept, the reality, the implications, need education on this any solution has to be framed within shared understanding or the reality
- There are deep divides in our community with people’s beliefs about fossil fuel development. If we are trying to develop goals around economic development, that there is some consensus on, how do we overcome the divide in beliefs (e.g. halt fossil fuel development vs expand it) the same goes for values around retail (e.g. “no Wal-Marts”) and other economic sectors
- How do we ensure “socially jus” economic development? E.g. factory placement and pollution tends to occur in low income areas. How do we actively advocate for voices not heard?? Grass roots

At Your Table... What do you believe to be the + (Positives) of Today's Meeting

What do you believe to be the Δ (Deltas) of today's meeting?

+

- All positive – great people, great ideas, great collaboration
- Fun and good lunch
- Excellent group participants
- Excellent sharing opportunity
- Participation from 4 States and tribes; diverse groups
- Everyone participated
- Great facilitation
- Meeting space was good
- Technology was good
- Good food/Good Food
- Good participation – everyone giving input
- Outside/independent facilitation
- Able to openly discuss where Oil and Gas people are not
- New/bigger network of people to take to
- Durango – Moab next?
- Increased understanding of issues
- Learn about foundations of initiative
- Robust conversation
- Final report very informative
- Participation from key players and agencies very good
- Excellent facilitation and presenters “making the case and informing the process



- Need better sharing of activities done/completed on website
- How do you utilize individual expertise
- Clearly define goals of the project
- What are next action steps within the next year
- No clear direction to meeting location
- Disconnect from morning session
- Afternoon session didn't feel like a continuation from morning session
- Inclusiveness
- On 5 Cent solution part, either not enough time or we weren't clear on what to do (on appendix activity)
- Increase range of stakeholders engaged/represented
- Format (Brainstorming strategies) – Simplify
- Missing stakeholders
- No Coffee
- Offer a break
- Wrap it up (tell purpose and end goal)
- As we go to the “public” keep it layman – they won't know this level of stuff(Suggestion/comment)
- Short notice regarding meeting; limited potential engagement/participation
- Information on parking – could have ordered parking permits in advance
- .05 solutions – many of the items in that category (e.g. water management plan) are more complex (e.g. \$5Billion) and so hard to address quickly
- Need more time for these activities – perhaps next time allow people to self-select to breakouts in areas of their expertise